Analysis of consumers' preferences for typical local cheese in Albania applying conjoint analysis



Drini Imami, Engjell Skreli, Edvin Zhllima,
Agricultural University of Tirana
Catherine Chan-Halbrendt, University of Hawaii at
Mänoa
Maurizio Canavari, University of Bologna
Alban Cela, INSTAT

Albania

- Economic Growth
 - Dairy industry is growing
- Increasing imports of cheese
 - Cheese consumer preferences important
- Benefit to stakeholders
 - Production & Marketing
 - Potentials for introducing PDO/GI schemes.

Previous Albanian consumer studies

- Albanian consumers prefer domestic cheese to imported one (Imami et al, 2013).
- Consumers have strong preference for cheese from specific regions of Albania (Imami and Skreli, 2013).
- No previous experimental studies/surveys for consumers preferences for typical local cheese carried out in Albania (to the best of authors knowledge).

PDO in consumer studies

- De Souza and Ventura (2001) recognition as PDO is the most important attribute for the choice of traditional cheeses, followed by price, texture and unit of sale
- Bonnet and Simioni (2001) no willingness to pay for a Protected Designation of Origin (PDO) – French Camembert cheese
- Tendero and Bernabéu (2005) Consumers value most the PDO labelled cheese as a guarantee of quality and food safety
- Garavaglia et al (2011) PDO certification greatly influences cheese purchasing decisions, increasing consumer willingness to pay.

Objective

- Determine consumer preferences for cheese in Tirana, Albania.
 - Group consumers according to their preferences for the main cheese attribute,
 - Assess preferences of each identified class for each of the attributes.
- Methods
 - Conjoint Choice Experiment
 - Latent Class Analysis

Survey administration

- Direct interviews by trained graduate students
- Sample 210
- Carried out in Tirana (the country capital and the main market) in summer 2013

Methodology

- Selection of Attributes
- Assignment of attribute levels
- Construction of Choice sets (using Sawtooth, Inc)
- 4. Data Collection
- 5. Data Analysis

Attribute	Levels				
Price (ALL/kg)	400	600	800	1000	
Origin	Shkoder	Korce	Gjirokaster		
Type of milk	Cow milk	Goat milk	Sheep milk		
Type of cheese	Yellow cheese	White cheese			

Latent Class Analysis

McFadden (1974)

$$P_{ni} = rac{\exp\left(\eta X_{ni}
ight)}{\displaystyle\sum_{h=1}^{I} \exp\left(\eta X_{nh}
ight)}$$

Where η denotes the scale parameter, Xni is the deterministic component

$$P_{ni} = \frac{\exp(\eta \beta Z_{ni})}{\sum_{h=1}^{I} \exp(\eta \beta Z_{nh})}$$

Where Z_{ni} are the explanatory variables of X_{ni} , and β is the vector of estimated parameter coefficients

Product attributes

- type of milk (T), Type of cheese (Tc), origin (O) and price (C);
- CAIC 3 classes of consumers

Model intepretation

- CAIC is used to determine the best model smaller values of CAIC are preferred and bigger values of CHI square, Bozdogan (1987).
- The CAIC falls drastically when moving from 2 class segmentation to 3 class segmentation;
- A model of 3 class was chosen for the segmentation of cheese consumers.

Estimated parameters, relative importance of attributes and size consumer classes

Attributes	Levels	Class 1	Class 2	Class 3		
Size (%)		29.1%	22.2%	48.7%		
Attribute importance	(%)					
Price		64.8%	21.5%	44.2%		
Type of milk		2.8%	3.5%	8.4%		
Type of cheese		16.0%	11.1%	11.7%		
Origin		16.4%	63.9%	35.7%		
Estimated parameters						
Price		-1.31479**	0.54490**	-0.10779**		
Type of Milk	Cow milk	-0.10785	0.00510	-0.01666		
	Goat milk	0.06240	-0.13698	0.03903		
	Sheep milk	0.04545	0.13188	-0.02236		
Type of Cheese	White cheese	0.48845**	0.41884**	-0.04543		
	Kashkavall cheese	-0.48845**	-0.41884**	0.04543		
Origin	Shkodra cheese	-0.12359	-1.34195**	-0.04543		
	Korca cheese	-0.43685**	-1.75133**	0.15324**		
	Gjirokastra cheese	0.56044**	3.09328**	-0.10780**		

Conclusions

- Region of origin is an important attribute for two of the consumer classes.
- Potentials to develop regional brands, including Geographical Indications or Protected Designation of Origin.
- Private businesses may also consider developing short market chains to protect brands.

References (selected)

- Bonnet, C., & Simioni, M. (2001). Assessing consumer response to Protected Designation of Origin labelling: a mixed multinomial logit approach. *European Review of Agricultural Economics*, 28(4), 433-449.
- Bozdogan, H. (1987). Model selection and Akaike's information criterion (AIC): The general theory and its analytical extensions. *Psychometrika*, *52*(3), 345–370.
- de Souza Monteiro, D. M., & Lucas, M. R. V. (2001). Conjoint measurement of preferences for traditional cheeses in Lisbon. *British Food Journal*, 103(6), 414– 424.
- Garavaglia, C., & Marcoz, E. M. Paper 1: Consumer Preferences And Certification Of Origin. A Conjoint Analysis of the Case of Fontina Cheese. ENHANCING REGION DEVELOPMENT THROUGH TYPICAL FOOD MARKETING AND DESTINATION BRANDING, 13.
- Imami, D., and Skreli, E. (2013). Consumer preferences for regional/local products in Albania. Report prepared for FAO.
- Imami, D., Zhllima, E., Merkaj, E., Chan-Halbrend, C., and M. Canavari. (2013). Clustered preferences for powdered milk use in cheese-making: A latent class analysis of a choice experiment with Albanian consumers. *IFAMA World Forum* 2013.
- Tendero, A., & Bernabéu, R. (2005). Preference structure for cheese consumers: a Spanish case study. *British Food Journal*, 107(2), 60-73.

Thank You!